| Submitted On        | Name            | In your opinion what should be done with the Monuments                      | Message  |
|---------------------|-----------------|---|--|
| 04/01/2018 17:54:48 | Shannon Dowling | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.                                  | Please remove the monuments. We are no longer the Richmond that was the capital of the Confederacy, we are now a Richmond tgat is diverse, loving, inclusive, creative, artistic, and supportive of one another. Let's present ourselves as a city of the future, not the past.  |
|                     |                 |   | I believe we should add context and "rebrand" Monument Avenue to reflect the Story of Virginia, not just the Civil War. The Confederacy lasted only 4 years. Virginia's history covers more than 400 years. This 1% aberration does not reflect Virginia's history, but it is a part of our history. Today we had the Easter Parade and everyone had a wonderful time, with best Easter Bonnet contests held at the feet of the Robert E. Lee monument. In two weeks, the Monument Avenue 10K will take place. Monument venue is a place for community activity and it will be a shame to turn it into a place of contention. We can under current law add historical panels that tell this story AND we should add to the history up to 1989 election of Douglas Wilder as Governor, and the twenty-first century when Virginia twice voted for Barack Obama as President. That is the true story of Virginia. We must not gloss over the ugly parts of slavery, segregation, and Massive Resistance. The triumphs since 1989 show our progress as a community and as a Commonwealth. Current law permits adding this context without any legislative action. The MOC had the City Attorney legal review summary is given below for convenience. There should be no conflict about this. truth is truth. History is our history. We do not want to erase it as Stalin did. We must learn from it. |
|                     |                 |   | Note the summary of legal requirements from the Nov. 14, 2017 MOC Meeting given below.  Monument Avenue Commission Legal Review Summary taken from MAC website.  |
| 04/01/2018 20:41:17 | Sheryl Baldwin  | Add context to the monuments.,<br>Add more monuments to<br>Monument Avenue. | The City Attorney issued a legal opinion to the Monument Avenue Commission for the November 14th work session.  "To summarize my conclusions, no such monuments may be removed except at the risk of exposure to legal liabilities until either the courts or the General Assembly provide clarity to certain generally applicable state laws. Some monuments, including the Monument Avenue statues, may not be removed without still further action by the General Assembly to negate restrictions contained in the City Charter. Finally, placing permanent markers near the monuments that provide contextual information about them, and do not either disturb the monuments themselves or interfere with the ability of reasonable people to view them, would likely be viewed as being consistent with state law without further action by either the courts or the General Assembly."  City Attorney Allen Jackson   |
| 04/01/2018 21:11:35 |                 | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.                                  | Time to take down the statues. If you want to maintain history, they would be great at the VHS or Tredager Ironworks.  |

| 04/01/2018 22:02:44 Ken cahoon      | Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.   | I am a member of the Sons of Confederate Veterans but I don't speak for that organization. These comments are my personal thoughts. I have loved the history and lore of the civil war since childhood. I would like to suggest a monument dedicated to the brave black regiments who fought at New Market Heights and other closely related battlefields. The battlefields are only 3 or 4 miles from Richmond. The area I speak of can be observed from the Church Hill neighborhood. The Medal of Honor, our country's highest military honor, was award to 14 black soldiers. Now let me say, these blacks soldiers were trying to kill my ancestors but I can certainly honor their commitment and courage to bring monumental change to all the people of this nation. I have heard suggestions of monuments dedicated to other black pioneers but those names are not directly tied to the events that came about because of the war. I cannot think of a better way to honor the service and commitment of those 14 black soldiers than a monument on Monument Avenue. Let me also say: I feel if one or all of monuments are removed because people find the monuments to be offensive then it only stands to reason that everything connected to the Confederacy is offensive and therefore it all must be removed. The White House of the Confederacy, Chimborazo Hospital, the Tredegar Iron Works, the Confederate Memorial Chapel, the Jefferson Davis statue in Hollywood cemetery, every statue of a Confederate soldier or officer, and every artifact connected to the Confederacy. I try to walk everyday at the Cold Harbor battlefield park. I see first hand, the number of tourists and tourists dollars being spent in the Richmond area. Let us work together to build up rather than tear down history. Let us, as citizens of Virginia, show the citizens of our country that we in Virginia can tell the whole and complete history of the civil war which occurred in the Richmond, Va. area. Thank You |
|-------------------------------------|--|--|
| 04/02/2018 10:36:42 Jerome Schulman |  | I have recently submitted my suggestion to the Mayor, which I will send to you via a separate email.  Thank you.   |
| 04/02/2018 19:51:47 Lyn Swallen     | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments. | Jefferson Davis should go. I see no reason to honor him in any way. The soldiers I have less hostility to. I wouldn't care if they stayed because to me soldiers are the instrument of the political leaders. They lived in a world where one's loyalty to one's states was higher than to the United States. It was the war itself that changed the thinking of the nation. That said, it wouldn't hurt my feelings if they weren't there. The Maury monument should stay. The Pathfinder of the Seas has a different story that should be honored, despite his connection to the Confederacy.  I would hate to see a bunch of empty pedestals so there should be something to replace them that would fit the character of the neighborhood. Please no garish avant-garde statues.   |

| 04/02/2018 21:34:37 | Michael Regulinski      |                                  | I moved to Richmond from Cleveland Ohio 20 years ago, and have lived on the 3200 block of Monument Ave for about 10 years. The city has changed and improved over the past 20 years, black and white residents are learning to live with one another, and I am happy to call it home. I agree that the civil war monuments should come down because they glorify men who fought to preserve slavery, which was a wicked and inhumane institution. I hope that the city replaces them with big, beautiful water fountains, which are used in old European cities with great success as a community centers and gathering places. The statutes should then be placed into the various civil war museums within and around the city. If no museum will take them, then the city will have to build one.  I realize that all this is an expensive proposition, and the city has many demands on its limited resources. However, like building new schools, the city can do it one at a time. Develop the plan, take the Jefferson Davis statue down first, replace it with a big fabulous fountain, and show the city residents and the state that the city can implement the plan to address the remaining statutes.  Another idea that could be implemented with less cost is to take down the statute and the plaques, leave the foundation and base, and build a stair step to the top of the base where people could stand where the statute once was. This idea has been implemented in eastern Europe, where countries and governments are grappling with what to do with the numerous Lenin statutes installed by Communist governments.  I greatly appreciate the difficult position the city is in, and what a difficult job the Commission has. I pray that you have the courage to do the right thing in the face of opposition, and recommend that the statutes he taken down with plans to replace them with water fountains. |
|---------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------------|---|
| 04/02/2018 21:34:37 | Michael Regulinski      | monuments.                       | recommend that the statutes be taken down with plans to replace them with water fountains.  To the Commission.  |
| 04/04/2018 8:53:07  | Margaret McGuire Seiler | Add context to the monuments.    | I was born at St. Luke's Hospital in Richmond in 1958. My great-grandfather was Dr. Hunter Holmes McGuire, the celebrated Civil War surgeon whose statue sits in front of the Governor's mansion. His youngest daughter, Margaret, was my grandmother. My parents, Peggy and Bob Seiler, were active members of the Richmond community for decadesin the Episcopal church and in social service and civic organizations such as the Richmond chapter of NAMI (National Alliance for the Mentally III). My father founded the Shepherd's Center of Richmond and was a founder of Gateway Homes in Chesterfield. My mother was an associate with McGuire Woods & Battle. While I don't live in Richmond, I consider it my home. My message is this: the city should hire well-known African American artists like Kara Walker, Glenn Ligon, and artists affiliated with VCU to make public art in response to the monuments. Leave the statues in place but add to the landscape with vital, groundbreaking art! Continue to grow Richmond's reputation as a historic city that is also a first-class art destination. Thank you.   |
|                     |                         |                                  | The monuments should be left where they are. If there is interest, will, and funding to memorialize other parts and aspects of history, we should do so in other parts of the city.   |
| 04/04/2018 8:56:15  | Meredith Haynes         | Leave the monuments as they are. | Focus more on substance and less on symbolism. Make our schools better and our city safer.  |
| 04/04/2018 9:02:28  | May Jane Moffett        | Add context to the monuments.    | The Egyptians don't tear down the Pyramids, The Romans don't rear down the forum, The Hebrews don't tear down the Temple Mount, The Russians don't tear down the Palaces of the Csars.  Historical Monuments are reminders of the past, good or bad.  If we destroys all monuments of of the Confederacy it is conceivable that in time, people could claim that the black race was never enslaved in America as there would be nothing to prove it. Denial of an event is a sure sign of a psychological problem.  Remember and teach.   |

| 04/04/2018 9:08:20  | Matthew Haynes   | Leave the monuments as they are.  | The monuments need to be left alone. There is no need for alteration or modification.  |
|---------------------|------------------|---|--|
| 04/04/2018 9:56:56  |                  | Leave the monuments as they are., Add context to the monuments.   | Momument Ave is a living breathing, outdoor museum Richmond is like London or Boston with tons of outdoor sites and iconography Add context, make them a part of a "trail" or guided walk through the city Our history is our history. Not great but its what we have. We must avoid the "Procrustean Bed" approach Thanks!  |
| 04/04/2018 18:33:22 | Adam Parsons     | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.   | Removal is the only ethical choice; relocation is a compromise for peace between groups.   |
| 04/05/2018 14:04:43 | James Threatte   | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.   | The civil warm monuments should be relocated to a park or other venue where they can be viewed in a museum-like setting intended to teach the complete and accurate history of the Civil War. These individuals from the Confederate States were traitors to the United States of America and should not be honored. The cause they fought for was despicable.   |
| 04/06/2018 11:02:52 | Mariia Zimmerman | Remove the monuments from<br>Monument Avenue., Add context<br>to the monuments., Add more<br>monuments to Monument<br>Avenue. | Monument Avenue stretches for miles into Henrico County with ample opportunity, it would seem, to provide space for additional monuments that do more than just glorify a 4 year period of Richmond's history (+ Arthur Ashe). Given all the art and cultural resources and talent in this region, and the rich history of our state and city to the larger tapestry of American history and culture it would seem we could do much, much better. While I would like to see the Civil War monuments removed, or contextualized, I understand this is not what many in the community want. That said, the Jefferson Davis/Confederate state monument is an atrocity. Davis was NOT a Virginian, unlike the other generals and Maury. He committed high treason against the United States and is responsible as the President of the Confederacy for atrocities against thousands of Americans both slave and non-slave. That we honor him (read the text on the monument!!) with the largest and most garish monument on the Avenue is absolutely unacceptable! |
| 04/09/2018 9:08:57  | Keith Brooks     | Leave the monuments as they are.  | Leave the Monuments as they are.   |
| 04/09/2018 10:09:11 | Steven Hicks     | Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.   | I favor taking the Monuments down from their pedestals which would make them less a source of worship, and placing them on the ground. As a teaching tool they should be put in context with the role of African Americans in Richmond which could include statues that depict race relations: one that commemorates the contributions of all African-American soldiers from the Revolutionary war to the present, a statue of Oliver Hill, a statue depicting slaves and former slaves, especially women, who spied on the Confederacy, and a statue of former Governor Linwood Holton depicting the scene of him taking his daughter to an integrated school facing another one of African American children attending previously all white schools. This would be very expensive but the money could be raised from the Richmond corporate community.   |
| 04/09/2018 19:38:26 | Adam Gregory     | Leave the monuments as they are.  | The monuments constitute a critical component of Richmond's unique character. Given the competition among localities along the East Coast corridor for population and capital, diluting that character by changing the monuments stifle Richmond's chances of winning finite resources and is, therefore, the wrong course of action for Richmond's future. Please consider the big picture - a historic gem like Monument Ave., as it currently stands, is absolutely irreplaceable and should not be disturbed. Thank you.   |

| 04/10/2018 8:58:09  | Margaret Seiler | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue. | I'm sorry to be writing to you againI wrote to you just a few days ago saying I thought that, if the city can get world class artists like Kara Walker and Glenn Ligon to add public art to contextualize the monuments, then they should stay. I want to be clear: as a white descendant of Stonewall Jackson's surgeon, Dr. Hunter Holmes McGuire, my opinion should NOT trump the opinions of the African American community. After listening to the eloquent demands of the Defenders for Freedom, I have changed my mind. Get the Confederate community to pay to remove the statues and create a memorial park for them. Remove the statues. Bring Richmond into the 21st century! Join with voices like Bryan Stevenson of the Equal Justice Initiative in Montgomery and Rev. Barber of Repairers of the Breach. Thank you.   |
|---------------------|-----------------|--|---|
|                     |                 |  | The Monuments should start at Shockoe bottom in a chronological way, with the history of the native Americans progressing to downtown with the revolutionary war (Washington at Capitol Square) continuing with the SAD WAR and the courageous, however, slavery protector generals that fought the civil sad war and then continuing on Monument Avenue with more contemporary Richmond iconic figures. I would definitely move the Maggie Walker statue to Monument Av. We should accept the offerings from the large corporations to pay for the new statues and crowdsource the reminder of the amount needed. I suggest making the state, the city, and the surrounding counties impose a one-time "beautification" tax to further contribute to the project, that could be on a sliding scale related to income. I will invite the old families that were slave owners to contribute a "clean conscience" monetary contribution if they wish (do these people exist? or if the war wasn't lost they would still have slaves, I wonder?) and use local artists that can be commisioned the artwork. The sculpture department at VCU is one of the best in the country. I would involve them as well. I would extend the sculptures/monuments to Boulevard Avenue, both going towards the river in the Museum area and going north in Scotts Addition. We need to embark on a project that will make all the old Richmond tour books obsolete and that will generate a trendy set of visitors that will bring tourism income to our "town". Time to grow up guys. We need to think big. Let's not destroy the monuments form the sad war, let's make them a spec of sand that disappears in the midst |
| 04/11/2018 12:21:31 | Gladys BRENNER  | Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.     | of other better, more current and more relevant works of art. Let's engage the community, the local artists, the students, the Richmond old money, the corporations and every single individual to make Richmond a better place.  |

| 04/11/2018 21:30:19<br>04/15/2018 16:01:38 | monuments.  Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the monuments.   | housing, schools, criminal justice reform, etc.). Don't alienate them unnecessarily.  I would like to see the monuments removed from Monument Avenue. Their removal would not erase history but rather would send a message that their ideas, values and practices around race are not what we ascribe to today. As we continue to work toward equity, how can we do it in the shadow of these men?  |
|--|---|--|
|  | Leave the monuments as they are., Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue., Add context to the monuments., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue., Relocate the | arrived in Virginia in the 17th Century. I am eligible for membership in both the SAR and the SCV, but I've never joined either. That said, we should give much weight to the informed feelings of African-Americans insomuch as their feelings have been disregarded for much of the history of the monuments. I emphasize the word "informed" because those who call for all the monuments to be treated in the same way are not informed. The subjects of the monuments are not equally worthy of honor (or disdain).  At one extreme is the Davis monument; at the other, the Maury (no need to include Ashe here). Davis was not a Virginian, and his only noteworthy connection to Richmond or Virginia was as the Confederate president. His statue should be removed to the White House of the Confederacy or to the American Civil War Museum at Tredegar; the figure of Vindicatrix should similarly be removed. That monument should be redesigned, perhaps featuring statues of prominent African-Americans or persons of color; one option might be to invite contributions of figures from each of the 13 states represented on the arc of columns in the monument—much as each state has contributed figures to Statuary Hall at the U.S. Capitol. A civil rights or peace-making theme might be suggested to guide selection. As for Maury, he earned the honor of a monument for his contributions to mankind before the war ever took place; his actions during the war do not disqualify him from such honor. Leave his monument alone.  Turning to Jackson and Stuart, they are not of particular historical noteworthiness aside from their service in the Civil War, so their monuments, for all the emotional connection there may be to them, should be dismantled and the statues removed to Tredegar, the Virginia Museum of History & Culture, or (perhaps best) a battlefield where they served with distinction. If such an option is taken, replacement monuments should be erected in both locations with different themes, such as more recent military heroes from Virginia (e.g., Chesty Pul |

| 04/17/2018 7:19:15  | hale james    | Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.  | The Civil War did not end because of the fall of Vicksburg, the Confederate losses at Gettysburg, or the fall of Atlanta. Richmond had to be taken. When Richmond fell it received some noted visitors, President Lincoln is already represented at Tredegar Iron Works. U.S. Grant and ^Uncle Billy^ Sherman also visited.  I, as a former Yankee, believe that if we explained to some of those Yankee cities, our present difficulties. They might send one of their Grant and Sherman monuments. Just tell them that Grant and Sherman are needed to straighten things out in Richmond   |
|---------------------|---------------|---|--|
| 04/17/2018 15:26:55 | Brian Thomson | Add context to the monuments.,<br>Add more monuments to<br>Monument Avenue.   | Monument Avenue and its monuments are an integral part of one of the most interesting architectural and historic boulevards in our nation. Removing all or the majority of them just feels overly short-sighted and destructive. However, the current national dialogue about why they are there how they got there and what purpose they have today has merit and needs to be addressed. Adding context is fine beginning. The addition of other notable men and women in Richmond's and Virginia's history is constructive. The addition of a slave museum is meaningful and overdue acknowledgement of our ugly past and evolution. In that Jefferson Davis was not a Virginian, if any statue were to be removed, this would be my choice and use that space to something new and healing.   |
|                     |               |   | Briefly, I think the statues (or at least most of them) need to be moved to a museum setting. I personally think the Civil War Museum is the perfect place, but I would favor moving them to a place where people can choose to see them if they want.  My main suggestion, however, is in marketing/selling the change. I think if the focus is entirely on the "loss" of the statues, human nature will make people feel like something bad is happening. I think the focus should be on describing a future for Monument Ave. Monument Avenue should continue to be a street displaying Richmond's history, but the focus should be on our entire historynot just the southern view of the Civil War. The commission should consider proposing an alternative Monument avenue with statues commemorating key points throughout Richmond's history. I am not a history expert, but I assume a longer view of |
|                     |               | Remove the monuments from<br>Monument Avenue., Add more<br>monuments to Monument  | Richmond historical significance would include pre-revolution history, Revolutionary war history (Patrick Henry's speech?), Famous Richmonders (John Marshall), etc.  In that context I think it might make sense to leave one statue (possible Robert E Lee) commemorating the role Richmond played in the Civil War, but there should also be a slave trade statue for the same time period.  I believe that if you get Richmond focused on the possibility of new statues that do a better job of selling/displaying our past you will get people focused on what could be vs. what was lostwhich seems like an approach that usually works well with most people.  If it is an issue I think it would not be difficult to find corporate/individual donors to pay for the  |
| 04/17/2018 19:11:55 | Joe Kunkel    | Avenue., Relocate the monuments.  | changes. Most corporations headquartered in Richmond would love to see the monuments replacedit creates an image problem for recruiting new employees.   |
| 04/23/2018 16:36:36 | Erin White    | Remove the monuments from<br>Monument Avenue., Add more<br>monuments to Monument<br>Avenue., Relocate the<br>monuments. | Thank you for adding these checkboxes! I am not sure if the comments I submitted last fall were recorded, so I am submitting them again.  Please take down these statues. They don't represent this city and are only dividing us. The men they represent advocated for an economic and social system that relied on enslavement of black folks. This city needs public art that uplifts everyone and reminds us of who and what we can be. We have a world-class sculpture program at VCU that can find new ways to make Monument Avenue a tourism-worthy place. Please take the confederates down. We're tired.  |

| 04/27/2018 10:42:16 | Aimee Joyaux  | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue. | My suggestion is replace the emblems of repression on Monument Ave. with gardens – that maintains the formal integrity and property values of those homes and that beautiful thoroughfare without the desecration of celebrating slavery with monuments to these perpetrators.  |
|---------------------|---------------|--|---|
| 04/27/2018 10:42:16 | Aimee Joyaux  |  |   |
|                     |               | Remove the monuments from                  | interpretation of those laws, and laws can be changed. We do not need to decide whether that is likely or not. If the statues are truly historically or artistically significant, someone will be willing to pay to move them to a more appropriate site, which is not part of Richmond's public space. In many ways, this is an ethical and moral question. Leaving those statues on |
| 04/28/2018 14:50:09 | Beth Marschak | Monument Avenue.                           | Monument Avenue is wrong.   |

| 04/30/2018 15:00:14 | Beth Marschak  | Remove the monuments from Monument Avenue.                                  | This map shows a continuing impact from slavery, jim crow, and present day white supremacy and racism. Richmond is still a very segregated city. This map illustrates a difference in 20 years life expectancy between Richmond areas that are predominately African-American, and those that are primarily white people of European descent: https://www.rwjf.org/en/library/articles-and-news/2015/04/babies-born-just-miles-apart-incities-across-the-u-sface-larg.html  |
|---------------------|----------------|---|---|
| 04/30/2018 15:32:16 | David Wofford  | Add context to the monuments.,<br>Add more monuments to<br>Monument Avenue. | Richmond can never erase the fact that it was the capital of the confederacy, nor should it. The institution of slavery is something that we can all agree was amoral. Monument Avenue should be used as a teaching tool that should show all sides of our history. One of the most moving experiences you can have is a visit to Terezin concentration camp in the Czech Republic. They teach you about the people that were there especially the children. The difference between the Holocaust and the Civil War are vast, but we should learn from past mistakes. Richmond can be the best place to educate everyone about a pivotal part of the history of our country. With the distinction of Monument Avenue being a National Historic Landmark, Richmond should use this designation to lead the rest of the country in the current difficult conversations dealing with racism. The statues should remain with well thought of context. |
| 04/30/2018 19:37:45 | Donald Thomas  | Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.                                      | Monument ave is a National Historic Ave and nothing should be removed. Adding more monuments would be best. Maggie Walker should have been added along with other prominent Virginians.   |
| 04/30/2018 19:40:38 | Robert Bauer   | Leave the monuments as they are., Add more monuments to Monument Avenue.    | The historic monuments on Monument Ave are war memorials. Would you condemn the memory of Vietnam Veterans because you don't agree with that war or the politics of the day? Would you add context saying they fought for the wrong cause? Civil War monuments are no different. Confederate soldiers were no more fighting for slavery than our young men and women in the service today are fighting for abortion. Leave this unique US National Landmark alone.  |
| 04/30/2018 20:30:32 | Chris Tichacek | Leave the monuments as they are.  | Stop the divisivness, leave the monuments alone.  |
| 04/30/2018 20:35:01 | Rhonda Florian | Leave the monuments as they are.  | Monument Avenue should be left alone. It is a beautiful National Historic Landmark.   |
| 04/30/2018 21:23:21 | Jason Poe      | Leave the monuments as they are.  | You would be wise to abandon this disgraceful left wing, racially charged political endeavor. Honor our Confederate War Dead, and may God continue to Bless the Commonwealth of Virginia. Deo Vindice. We are watching. God Bless.  |
| 04/30/2018 21:25:22 | Jason Poe      | Leave the monuments as they are.  | You would be wise to abandon this disgraceful left wing, racially charged political endeavor. Honor our Confederate War Dead, and may God continue to Bless the Commonwealth of Virginia. Deo Vindice. We are watching. God Bless.  |